

### KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA NATION-RELIGION-KING

# MINISTRY OF HEALTH GENERAL DIRECTORATE FOR HEALTH HOSPITAL SERVICE DEPARTMENT

# MINUTES OF PUBLIC CONSULTATIVE WORKSHOP ON DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK (EMF) AND RESETTLEMENT POLICY FRAMEWORK (RPF) DEVELOPMENT FOR HEALTH EQUITY AND QUALITY IMPROVEMENT (H-EQIP) PROJECT NOVEMBER 5, 2015

Objectives of the workshop: To communicate with key stakeholders the preparation of draft EMF and RPF as well as to receive comments/suggestion for improvement.

Chairman:

Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry

Venue:

Ministry of Health, Room 5-F 4

Time:

8:00 - 12:00

Participants:

38 participants from the Ministry of Health, Civil Society Organizations, Ministry of Environment, HSSP2 Secretariat, HSSP2 Construction Contractors and Supervision Firms and the

World Bank (Participants List and Agenda attached)

Presenters:

1. Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey, Deputy Director of Hospital Service Department on Project Description and EMF; and

2. Dr. Khuon Eng Mony, Consultant/ HSSP2 on RPF.

#### Program:

Welcome Remarks - Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry welcome to all delegation and participants, and mentioned the objective of the meeting that is to share with stakeholders a preparation of 2 documents including Draft Environment Management Framework (EMF) and Draft Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), to minimize the environmental and social impact by project and receive feedback.

## Summary of Presentations, Discussions and Comments /Suggestions:

#### Presentations made at the meeting included:

- a. "The Project Description" by Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey, Deputy Director of Hospital Service Department
- b. "The Environment Management Framework" by Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey, Deputy Director of Hospital Service Department
- c. "The Resettlement Policy Framework" by Dr. Khuon Eng Mony, Consultant/ HSSP2

### a. The Project Description

Dr. Rasmey, provided presentations on project background, Project Development Objective (To improve quality of public health services and protect the poor and other vulnerable groups from impoverishment due to cost of health services in the Kingdom of Cambodia), Project Beneficiaries and main 4 project components.

## b. The Draft Environment Management Framework

- Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey provided presentations on overview of the Bank Safeguard Policies as a set of corporate/government laws, principles, regulations, and procedures aimed at reducing and mitigating the unintended or unavoidable environmental and social impacts of development projects and programs, safeguard policy triggered by the project including OP/BP 4.01 on environmental assessment, EMF main objectives, EMF key Contents, environmental Impacts Screening, mitigation measures, generic environmental management plan, implementation arrangements and recommendations for training, capacity building.
- Dr. Lo Veasnakiry mention on importance of preparation of safeguards document/instruments for the new proposed project named Health Equity and Quality Improvement Project, H-EQIP and emphasize the importance of consultation process to obtain feedbacks from concerned stakeholders as part of these safeguards instruments preparation.
- Mr. Mok Sophea, MOE, agreed with this proposal which mention in the presentation. He
  mentioned also on pre-assessment of construction project to see any impact social, cultural and
  safety. Disclose to public in advance and consult with local authorities and communities. Medical
  waste both solid and liquid are needed strictly control. It is going to affect environment if carelessly.
- Dr. Kol Hero, Preventive Medicine Department, suggested that infrastructure design should include emergency exit and should support disable people. He also suggested that MoH to take lead on monitoring of water quality and health care waste generation rate from health facilities (HF).
- Mrs. Chea Saren, RHAC, suggested that measures to ensure minimum impacts on patient'shygiene during construction and renovation of infrastructure should be prepared. Potential impacts include dust, noise, water supply, etc.
- Ms. Wasittee, WB consultant, added that the EMF will cover measures to prevent and/minimize
  impacts to patients, health facility's staff and nearby residents including hygiene aspects. The
  relevant measures will be attached as part of civil works construction contract.
- Mr. Kong Siphat, representative from Vimeanchey, Construction Company, agreed with the
  proposed measures in this presentation. However, he mentioned that implementation of these
  measures need to be included in the construction cost together with other construction materials,
  design and labor cost.
- Mr. Bou Saroeun, WB Communication Officer, provide additional clarification that the WB will
  conduct implementation support missions twice a year to follow up and provide advice or support
  to ensure that requirements in these safeguard instruments are appropriately implemented.
- Dr. Khun Eng Mony, HSSP2 consultant, raised question on past experienced in cost preparation for construction safety.
- Mr. Kong Siphat, explained that cost for construction safety was included as part of procurement, specification and drawing design.
- Mr. So Samoeun, shared that location of incinerator in some health facilities located close to nearby residents and create concerns on smoke from burning. Some HFs has concerns over quality of infrastructure (emphasized on latrine). Most of toilets at health centers and hospitals are broken and do not build/design for disabled people.
- Mrs. Chork Rany, ADRA, was sharing the experience with supported to building some health centesr and health posts in her project area, high consider on latrine, post septic, main road need to improve in the future time as adaptation to local culture/ behavior change of community. Old style toilet should be considered given the awareness of how to use a new style toilet is still limited among poor and rural patients. Water supply should be considered for the toilet as well.
- Mr. Yim Sovann, SC, shared the same concern on quality of infrastructure especially on water supply system. Some health facilities experiences damage of equipment after 1 year of construction and water shortage in dry season for water reservoir.
- Dr. Kiry Thanks to all recommendations and suggestions from the participants. In response to
  all the above suggestions and concerns, the project design and EMF will take into account all
  aspects including environmental, safety, quality and financial aspects and consider all relevant
  recommendations and concerns into the draft final document,

- Dr. Mony presented the draft RPF and focus on scope of the land acquisition policy and procedures framework for health infrastructure, policy principles, and the entitlements relating to specific categories of impacts and consultations and its information disclosure.
- · Dr. Kiry mentioned that there are some law and regulation on land acquisition during this time.
- Mr. Kong Siphat, Vimeanchey, reply for Dr. Kiry, law land management can be identified by zone
  of commerce, zone of resident and zone of resort and law are reserve of 55% for building and 45%
  land scape for parking.
- Mrs. Chork Rany, ADRA, mentioned that one of the current issues is on fire truck access as many
  areas do not provide enough space for fire trucks to access in case of fire or emergency. Therefore,
  sufficient space for emergency access for vehicle e.g. fire truck should be taken into account in
  the design of construction of new health centers or hospitals.
- RHAC, raised that construction safety and quality are correlated to the bidding cost, therefore the WB should not consider only selecting cheapest price during the bidding process.
- CHC, commented on size of the land that there should be standard land size for construction of health facilities.
- Mr. Kong Siphat, Architect, commented that the designs (land scape, road, building, water and electricity) should consistent with bidding documents.
- Dr. Kiry was concluded this discussion, in summary it is clear enough information and he thanked all members that provides the brainstorming for working group to update the draft of RPF in the next few weeks and ask WB team for any comments.

#### **Next Steps**

- Reflection from world bank team:
  - Mr. Juan Martinez, happy with this active process of consultative workshop, well dialogue, and good history from MOE. The new instruments should have with quality of TOR of construction.
  - Ms. Wasittee, happy to learn a constructive discussions obtained from this consultation workshop and appreciated all comments and suggestions, which are helpful for improvement of project design and safeguards instruments preparation. She re-emphasized that due to specific project activities have not been identified the project prepare EMF as a framework to identify and manage impacts that may arise from future identified activities. This EMF also contains Environmental Management Plan (EMP) for typical civil works as this EMF is built on the on-going HSSP2 project.
- The MoH request for written feedbacks from all stakeholders by E-mail, before November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2015, and respond by Mr. Ngeth Narin, HSSP2.
- The EMF and RPF will be revised incorporating relevant comments from this meeting and other written comments if any, and disclose at MOH website and to all NGOs working at health sector through MEDICAM on the first week of December, 2015.
- Translate all presentations will be translated to Khmer and shared with all PHDs for comments by November 30, 2015.

Finally, **Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry** thanked all participants of the meeting with the best wishing and declared the meeting closed at 12:00 PM. Dr. Kiry also mentioned once all the safeguard instruments prepared, the MOH may consider adopting them as the safeguard frameworks of the MOH and not only for H-EQIP.

Seen and Approved Chairman

Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey

Minute's Taker

Dr. Lo VeasnaKiry

Minute for Public Consultative Workshop on Draft EMF/RPF Development November 5, 2015 Page 3 of 6 Annex 1 List of Participants Annex 2 Agenda

Annex 3 Three Presentations (Project Description, EMF, RPF)

Annex 4 Photo from Consultation Workshop

ANNEX 1

## KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA NATION-RELIGION-KING

MINISTRY OF HEALTH
GENERAL DIRECTORATE FOR HEALTH
HOSPITAL SERVICE DEPARTMENT

# LIST OF PARTICIPANTS PUBLIC CONSULTATIVE WORKSHOP ON EMF/SPF DEVELOPMENT NOVEMBER 5, 2015

N	Name	Position	Post/ Place of Work	Tel Contact	E-mail Address
1	Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry	Director	DPHI/ MOH	012 810-505	loveasnakiry@gmail.com
2	Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey	Deputy Dir	HSD/ MOH	012 420-222	lcrasmey@gmail.com
3	Dr. Ly Nareth	Health Team	WB/ Phnom Penh	012 620-481	nly@worldbank.org
4	Dr. Khuon Eng Mony	Consultant	HSSP2/MOH	012 862-033	monykhemara@yahoo.com
5	Ms. Wasittee U	Environment al Consultant	WB/ Bangkok	096 597-4562	
6	Mr. Juan Martinez	Senior Social Specialist	WB/ Washington DC		
7	Mr. Bou Saroeun	Com. Office	WB/ Phnom Penh	012 414-088	
8	Dr. Kol Hero	Deputy Dir	DPM/MOH	017 999-586	
9	Dr. Ok Romnir	Officer	HSD/ MOH	012 623-205	okromnir@yahoo.com
10	Mr. Mok Sophea	Deputy Dir	MOE	012 763-636	0.
11	Mr. Bun Ly	Deputy office	MOE	012 845-799	
12	Mr. Koun Vibol	HSSP2	МОН	012 931-881	
13	Mr. Prak Naly	HSSP2	МОН	012 891-286	
14	Mr. Sao Phalla	HSSP2	МОН	012 967-659	
15	Mr. Nom Thaneth	HSSP2	МОН	012 891-412	
16		HEF officer	PFC	012 316-964	
17	Mr. Akila Seneviratre	Team Leader	RDC/SL	011 274-300	
18	Mr. Sok Chea	Consultant	Admin Credit	012 848-573	
19	Mrs. Chhork Rany	Health Cor	ADRA	012299-712	,
20	Mr. Prum Chyvorn	Admin	Envisioning Gr	078 424-494	
21	Mr. Hel Heng	Admin	Envisioning Gr	096 557-1799	
22	Mr. Ou Sambath Many	Cluster Mg	СНО	016 825-568	
23	Mr. Teng Theang	HF ProMg	AFH	012 854-486	
24	Mr. Chhon Hok	HEF ProMg	FHD	017 303-190	
25	Mr. Heng Bunsieth	E. Director	CHC	012 907-812	
26	Mr. Thaung Visal	SHO ProMg	CHC	017 753-365	
27	Mr. Kong Siphat	Cons Mg	Vimeanchay Gr	092 591-391	
28	Mr. Yim Sovann	Health Mg	Save the Children	012 863-070	
29	Mrs. Chea Saroeun	HEF Mag	RHAC	017 809-911	
30	Mr. Sreng Long	Director	MTA	012 793-455	
31	Mr. Khath Borith	Admin	MTA	078 795-550	
32	Mr. Bun Kheang	GM	BMG	011 632-424	
33	Mr. Heng Thou	Architect	TCO	012 728-109	
34	Mr. Sao Chhorn	ED	SHPA	096 717-2557	
35	Mr. Sam Samoeun	Mg Director	BPH	015 557-754	
36	Mr. Ses Soeung	Admin/HRM	BFH	071 254-1111	
37	Mr. Sun Sopheak	Deputy Dir	URC	017 303-399	
38	Mr. Un sothy	Procurement	T-Ro	017 303-399	

## KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA NATION-RELIGION-KING

# MINISTRY OF HEALTH GENERAL DIRECTORATE FOR HEALTH HOSPITAL SERVICE DEPARTMENT

### AGENDA

Consultative WS on the draft of EMF and RPF
Prepared for Cambodia Health Equity and Quality Improvement Program
November 5, 2015 (8:00-12:00)

Rome 5 Floor 4, Ministry of Health, Phnom Penh

Time	Topic	Responsible	Remarks	
8:00-8:30	Opening Speech	Dr. Lo Veasnakiry DPHI Director representative of H.E Prof Eng Huot Program Director	Facility by Dr. Ok Romnir Dr. Khoun Vibol	
8:30-9:00	Presentation on Project Background and Component	Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey Hospital Services Dpt DDirector		
9:00-9:30	Presentation on Environment Management Framework, EMF	Dr. Lon Chan Rasmey Hospital Services Dpt DDirector		
9:30-9:45	BREAK			
9:45-10:15	Presentation on Resettlement Policy Framework, RPF	Dr. Khuon Eng Mony PME/HSSP2		
10:15-11:45 Plenary Discussion		Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry Dr. Khuon Eng Mony Mr. Juan Martinez Ms. Wasittee Udchachone Dr. Ly Nareth		
11:45-12:00	Wrap up, and Closing	Dr. Lo Veasna Kiry		

# Health Equity and Quality Improvement Program Date: Thursday, November 05, 2015 Time: 08:00 Venue: Meeting room No.5, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, MoH. Name Title Organisation Signature Meeting

N	<sup>J⁰</sup> Name	Title	Organisation	Signature	Mobile Phone
1	Dr. Lo Veasnakiry	DPHI Director	МоН		
2	Eurn 4	deputy of office	MoE	Batil	012845799
3	The variasa	HEF officer	PFD	RHINE	012316969
4	THOUSE DEMONTANCE	Team Leader	RDC/SL	Juni mhu	017 274 300
5	SOK PHEA	Admin CADSIS	Consultant	Godh	012848573
6	CHOKK RANY	Health Coordinator	ADRA	chy :	0/2299712
7	Prace Naly	42365	MOH	-215	012891286
8	Jan Phelle	-4	-//-	Na A	012 96 76 79
9	Hom Thaneth	-0-	-14	005	ore 89-14-18
10	LON Chan Rasmey	Dep Direct of HRD	nou	Kas	012 420 222
11	Khuon Eng Mony	PME 1488 Pe Sia	HSSP2 /MAA	the	012862033
12	OKAOMNER	alts /MOH		73-2	012 623 205
13	Prum Chyvarn	Admyn	Envisioning	enth ADS	0784261154
14	Hel Henry	admin ass.	-4	JANEUN	096 55 717 99
15	Ou sambath many	claster manager	CITO		016 88 55 68
16	Jeng Theang	HF Program Hanager	AFH O	Olbai	012754486
17	Chron Hole	HER Grogram officer	FHD -	Cly	B17303190
18	Hery Bunsieth	E. Director	CHC	They berouth	012 907 842
	Thomas Usal	SHB. Brossom Managar	cue	All Markey	017753365
20	1 1	Construction Mange	Vinean chan (		292591391
21	MOK SOPHER	Deputy Dispetor.	MOB	Scohes	012763636.

N	Name	Title	Organisation	Signature	Mobile Phone
22	Yim Sovann	Heath Manager	Save the Children		
23	Chea Savan	LAEF Manager		Man Moun.	012863070
24		Director			017-8097-11
25	Khath Berith	Adas,	MTA	8	112793455
26	Bun kheung	BH	BHG	1	07879550
27	Kal Hero	posity Director	Mott, DPM	Kals	011632424
28	Masittee U.	Environmental Specialid	World Boul	Wasittee U	017999586
29	Ly Narates	Opens tions after	MB	Marines O.	O. C.
30	Straw MANTINEZ	SENIOR SOUAL DEVElopment.	P. WORLD BANK	796	012620481
31	Bou Saroeum	Commo officer	world Bank	136	012414088
32	HENG THOU	Brehiteet	TCO.	House	
33	SAO. CHHORN	ED	CHPA	CM2.	012 728 109
34	A SAM SAM OFUN	Hanaging Director	(BPI)		0967172557
35	Ses Speung	solving HD manager	BOY	GiV /	015557754
36	Sun Sopheac	Deputy Director	ALRC	And of	07/254/111
37	Un Sothy	Procurement officer	T-RO	10/125	017 303599
38	1	IN CATETOON OFFICE	FRO	-6	012368782
39					
40					
41					
42					
43					
44					
45					